



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

and economics (such as in France) has deprived our lawyer leaders of the opportunity for careful study of the mechanism confided to their charge (p. 296).

This assemblage at enormous labor of a mass of valuable data from widely scattered sources would hardly have been financed by an author, and demonstrates the usefulness of educational foundations. The book is, however, very hard reading. The reader jumps from state to state with bewildering frequency. Perhaps the multitude of states made this inevitable, but the interest would be far greater if the text had been limited to the opinions and rules about admission to the bar in two or three leading jurisdictions, with the others relegated to foot-notes. This might have made room among dates and statistics for more contemporaneous human touches, like Jefferson's denunciation of Virginia country lawyers as "an inundation of insects" (p. 404); or an early radical's view that lawyers should be as free from educational restrictions as doctors and clergymen—"A man's property is no better than his life or his soul" (p. 89); or the success of the early Litchfield, Connecticut, law school because of the presence of a girls' boarding-school, whose head informed an entering legal scholar, "The young ladies all marry law students" (p. 130).

Finally, excellent as Reed is on the external relations of the law schools to the bar, the fact, avowed with attractive frankness, that he is not a lawyer handicaps his discussion of their internal problems and of the law. Witness his questionable distinction between the case-method schools teaching the law as it ought to be and text-book schools showing better what it is (pp. 292, 385), his statement that the overruling of precedents first became noteworthy after the Civil War (p. 347), the analysis of the origins of American law (pp. 30-34). That our law has by no means "split off" (p. 33) from contemporary English decisions is exemplified by Chief Justice Taft's recent use of the House of Lords Taff Vale case in his Coronado labor decision. The association of a legal scholar with Mr. Reed would strengthen the forthcoming Bulletin on the contemporary situation.

ZECHARIAH CHAFEE, JR.

Papers of the San Francisco Committee of Vigilance of 1851. III. Minutes and Miscellaneous Papers; Financial Accounts and Vouchers. Edited by MARY FLOYD WILLIAMS. [Publications of the Academy of Pacific Coast History, vol. IV.] (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1919. Pp. xvi, 906.)

History of the San Francisco Committee of Vigilance of 1851: a Study of Social Control on the California Frontier in the Days of the Gold Rush. By MARY FLOYD WILLIAMS, Ph.D. [University of California Publications in History, vol. XII.] (Berkeley: University of California Press. 1921. Pp. xii, 543. \$5.00.)

EVERY investigator who has had occasion to consult H. H. Bancroft's *Popular Tribunals*, only to be more or less disappointed, will welcome this publication of the records of the Committee of Vigilance of 1851. As explained in an introductory note by the late Professor H. Morse Stephens, from the time that the Bancroft Collection came into the possession of the University of California in 1906 it was desired to publish the documents: "Not only were the papers themselves of surpassing interest as exhibiting a phase of frontier life under unexampled conditions, but they corrected widespread misrepresentations of early life in California" (p. iii). Parts I. and II., edited by Porter Garnett, were printed in 1910 and 1911, respectively (*Academy of Pacific Coast History, Publications*, vol. I., no. 7, and vol. II., no. 2). In 1913 Miss Mary Floyd Williams was induced by Professor Stephens to edit the remaining papers, in connection with her graduate studies at the University of California. Those in position to give assistance cordially co-operated with her, with the result that the volume of *Papers* gives ample evidence of careful editorship.

The records are published in chronological order and would be somewhat perplexing to the reader were it not for the minute analysis which has been made in the index and the addition of relevant appendixes and helpful foot-notes and cross-references. Contemporary newspapers and other sources have been consulted to explain allusions otherwise obscure. Since the public archives of San Francisco have been destroyed by fire, these papers constitute the chief record of the thought and conditions of life of an important period in the history of the city. It is a remarkably complete record of its kind, due to the fact that the president of the executive committee felt "a deep solicitude in the careful preservation of these documents" (*Report on Prisoners*, September 15, 1851, p. 639) and to the continuous service of a methodical and devoted secretary. "Merchants whose fortunes often turned on the chance of a single day, sat hour after hour at the bare table in the 'Executive Chamber' writing laborious, verbatim reports of the examinations and statements that fill the hundreds of pages preserved in the archives of the association" (editor's note, pp. x-xi).

The constitution of the Committee of Vigilance as "instituted the 8th of June 1851" is given in full. The minutes and miscellaneous papers cover nearly seven hundred and fifty pages of the volume, and the financial accounts and vouchers require fifty more pages. The appendixes include a list of the members of the committee, officers, and standing committees, record of attendance at meetings of the executive committee, analysis of the financial accounts, prisoners arrested by the Committee of Vigilance with a record of the disposition that was made of them, and a list of the criminals implicated by James Stuart and his confederates. The volume is illustrated by a map of San Francisco in 1851, facsimiles of certificate of membership, minutes of a general

meeting, etc.; also by a photograph of the banner presented to the Committee of Vigilance by the ladies of Trinity Church "As a Testimonial of their Approbation—Do Right and Fear Not".

The *History of the San Francisco Committee of Vigilance of 1851*, of which Miss Williams is the author, is designed to accompany the *Papers* and is based upon them, but is complete in itself. It is an effort to interpret their meaning in the light of an understanding of the social and political conditions of the time. The author's point of view differs very materially from that presented in the writings of Shinn, Royce, Bancroft, and others. In part I. she sets forth the chaotic conditions of the California frontier from 1848 to 1851. Part II. contains a careful study of the events in San Francisco which led to the organization of the Committee of Vigilance, followed by an analysis in detail of the work of the committee as revealed in the *Papers* and checked by an examination of newspaper files and other sources of information.

The author discusses the difficult problem of determining what influence the committee exerted toward the restraint of crime and the improvement of society. She finds some evidence which indicates that "the immediate result was a diminution of crime that deserves respectful attention" (p. 390). Lasting reforms in local politics or in local courts were not effected, however, although men who led among the Vigilantes were also leaders in other forms of civic activity (p. 392).

Miss Williams devotes a chapter to lynch law as a national problem, placing the California vigilance committees in their historical setting and deprecating the slowness with which we are developing in this country through our democratic institutions an effective legalized means of social control.

Much detailed work is required in a study of this nature and there is abundant evidence in these volumes of the author's perseverance and thoroughness. She has shown good judgment in handling her material. Both volumes have the earmarks of sound scholarship based on research. A few more or less obvious errors have been noted, chiefly typographical. Her work is a contribution of permanent value to the history of lynching as practised in the western part of the United States. The carefully edited *Papers* are also a reliable source of information on other matters of historical and sociological interest.

J. E. CUTLER.

The Life of Clara Barton, Founder of the American Red Cross. By WILLIAM E. BARTON. In two volumes. (Boston and New York: Houghton Mifflin Company. 1922. Pp. xvi, 348; 388. \$10.00.)

THE definitive *Life of Clara Barton* fills two large volumes. It is properly so divided, for there are two stories. One is an *Ilias Malorum*, the story of the miseries and sufferings of a war—our Civil War—as